# Case 3249

# Lithasia Haldeman, 1840 (Mollusca, Gastropoda): proposed conservation

## Russell L. Minton

Department of Zoology, Field Museum of Natural History, 1400 S. Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60605, U.S.A. (e-mail: rminton@fmnh.org)

## Arthur E. Bogan

North Carolina Museum of Natural Sciences, 4301 Reedy Creek Road, Raleigh, NC 27607, U.S.A. (e-mail: arthur.bogan@ncmail.net)

Abstract. The purpose of this application, under Article 23.9.3 of the Code, is to conserve the name *Lithasia* Haldeman, 1840 for a genus of freshwater prosobranch gastropods (family PLEUROCERIDAE) from the eastern United States. This name is already on the Official List of Generic Names in Zoology and has been in continuous use for over 140 years. However, it is threatened by a senior subjective synonym *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818. The name *Ellipstoma* has had little usage, and then mainly in lists. The names of its included species have never been adopted and suppression of the name *Ellipstoma* is proposed.

**Keywords.** Nomenclature; taxonomy; Gastropoda; PLEUROCERIDAE; freshwater prosobranch gastropods; *Lithasia; Lithasia geniculata*; eastern United States.

### **Application to the Commission**

1. Rafinesque (1818b, p. 42) briefly described a new genus *Ellipstoma* and included three new nominal species: *E. gibbosa, E. rugosa* and *E. zonalisa.* Hannibal (1912, p. 168) subsequently designated *E. gibbosa* as the type species of *Ellipstoma*. Morrison (1954, p. 363) claimed that Hannibal had misidentified the type species. In addition, Burch (1979, p. 98) stated that 'the identity of *Ellipstoma gibbosa* Rafinesque, 1818 is too doubtful to give nomenclatural validity to *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818'. The name *Ellipstoma* has had little usage, and then mainly in lists. The names of its included species have never been adopted and *Ellipstoma* does not appear in the online version of *Zoological Record* (1978–2001) or GeoRef (1758–2001).

2. Agassiz (1846a, p. 33) misspelled the name as *Ellipsostoma* and attributed it to Rafinesque, 1819 and later (Agassiz, 1846b, p. 136) listed this misspelling. Millard (1997, p. 86; 2001, p. 422) misspelled the genus as *Ellipsoma*.

3. Haldeman (1840, p. 1) described the genus *Lithasia*, and included one new species, *L. geniculata*, the type species of the genus by monotypy. The name *Lithasia* is already on the Official List of Generic Names in Zoology (see Opinion 1195; BZN 38: 259–265, November 1991). In addition, it has been used extensively in studies of the North American gastropod fauna (e.g. Walker, 1918; Morrison, 1940; Goodrich,

1941; Clench, 1965; Burch, 1979; Ahlstedt, 1980; Bogan & Parmalee, 1983; Clarke, 1983; Bogan et al., 1995; Holznagel & Lydeard, 2000; Minton, 2002). The Commission Secretariat holds an additional 33 usage references.

4. Morrison (1954, p. 363) considered *Ellipstoma gibbosa* (the type species of *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818) to be a senior subjective synonym of both *Melania armigera* Say, 1821 (currently *Lithasia armigera*) and *L. geniculata* (the type species of *Lithasia* Haldeman, 1840). This synonymy means that *Ellipstoma* is a senior subjective synonym of *Lithasia*.

5. In order to avoid undesirable changes in nomenclature and to preserve the stability of generic names in the family PLEUROCERIDAE, we propose that the widely used name *Lithasia* Haldeman, 1840 be conserved under Article 23.9.3 by the suppression of its senior subjective synonym *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818. *Lithasia* has had considerable usage (see para. 3 above), but *Ellipstoma* has had limited usage in the last 100 years (see para. 1 above) preventing automatic conservation of *Lithasia* under Article 23.9.1.1. *Lithasia* and its type species *L. geniculata* are already on the Official Lists (Opinion 1195; see para. 3 above).

- 6. The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:
- to use its plenary power to suppress the generic name *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818 for the purposes of the Principle of Priority but not for those of the Principle of Homonymy;
- (2) to place on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Generic Names in Zoology the following names:
  - (a) Ellipstoma Rafinesque, 1818, as suppressed in (1) above;
  - (b) *Ellipsostoma* Agassiz, 1846 (an incorrect subsequent spelling of *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818);
  - (c) *Ellipsoma* Millard, 1997 (an incorrect subsequent spelling of *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818).

# **Supporting information**

1. In 1818, Rafinesque indicated that *Ellipstoma* included four species, but did not list them (Rafinesque, 1818c, p. 107). The following year (1819, p. 424) he listed *E. gibbosa*, emended *E. zonalisa* to *E. zonalis*, and added two more nominal species to *Ellipstoma*: *E. marginula* and *E. vittata* (these are nomina nuda).

2. Haldeman (1841, p. 1) described the genus *Angitrema*, with *Melania armigera* Say, 1821 as the type species by monotypy. Herrmannsen (1852, p. 74) listed *Lithasia* and included only *L. geniculata*. Tryon (1863, 1865b) used *Lithasia* as a subgenus of *Angitrema*, but subsequently elevated *Lithasia* to full generic status (Tryon, 1865c). Pilsbry & Rhoads (1896, p. 496) considered *Angitrema* to be a subgenus of *Lithasia*, a decision that was further supported by Goodrich (1921).

3. Errors regarding the date of publication for *Ellipstoma* are common. Herrmannsen (1846, p. 418) & Scudder (1882, p. 120) both listed *Ellipstoma* (correct spelling), but cited 1819 as the date for the name. They also noted the variant spelling, *Ellipsostoma* (see para. 2 of the Application above). Later Scudder listed only the correct spelling, but again cited the date as 1819 (Scudder, 1884, p. 110). Sherborn (1926, p. 2117) and Neave (1939, p. 214) correctly listed the date of publication for *Ellipstoma* as 1818, and also noted the 1819 reference. Sherborn (1926, p. 2117) also noted Agassiz's misspelling. Stein (1976, p. 38) following Morrison (1954, p. 363)

used *Pleurocera* (*Ellipstoma*) gibbosa, but cited the date of publication of the specific name as 1820.

4. Recognition and usage of specific names included in Ellipstoma have been inconsistent, Binney (1860, pp. 8-9) listed E. gibbosa and E. zonalis, but E. marginula was listed as E. marginata, and all were placed in the genus Melania; E. rugosa was overlooked. H. & A. Adams (1854, p. 301) used Melania and included the misspelling Ellistoma as a synonym. Later, Binney (1863, p. 325) listed E. gibbosa, E. zonalis and E. rugosa, but overlooked E. marginula. Tryon (1873, p. xxi) reviewed all the preceding work on the family STREPOMATIDAE. Under the genus Leptoxis he commented on Rafinesque's 1819 paper and decided not to accept the genus Ellipstoma or any of its included species. He later concluded that Ellipstoma Rafinesque, 1819 was a senior synonym of Anculosa Say, 1821 (Tryon, 1873, p. xxxiv). Both Pilsbry (1917, pp. 110-111) and Goodrich (1929, p. 2) listed Ellipstoma and the included species as indeterminate. Fischer (1885, p. 706), Thiele (1929, p. 194) and Wenz (1938, p. 701) listed *Ellipstoma* Rafinesque, 1818 with a question mark under the genus Anculosa, Vaught (1989, p. 29) and Millard (1997, p. 86; 2001, p. 422) tentatively (and in the latter case as a misspelling, see para. 2 of the Application above) included it under Anculosa. Morrison (1954, p. 363) recognized Ellipstoma containing a single species as a subgenus of Pleurocera, using Pleurocera verrucosa Rafinesque as the type species of Pleurocera. Stansbery (1971, p. 11) listed Ellipstoma gibbosa Rafinesque, 1818 as rare and endangered with no further comments. Graf's (2001) lexicon not only overlooked all four species included by Rafinesque in Ellipstoma but incorrectly credited Binney as author of the taxa. Consistent usage of the name Ellipstoma was limited to works by Morrison (1954) and Stein (1976).

5. Rafinesque (1818a, p. 355) described a new genus Pleurocera and included six nominal species without descriptions, rendering them nomina nuda. The following year he again described the genus but without including any species (Rafinesque, 1819, p. 423). He later described P. verrucosa, the first species with an available name to be included in the genus (Rafinesque, 1820, p. 11). The incorrect subsequent spelling Pleurocerus was published in combination with the new specific name P. acutus Rafinesque in Blainville, 1824 (p. 236) and subsequently corrected to Pleurocera acuta (Rafinesque, 1831, p. 3). Tryon (1864, p. 24) applied the name Pleurocera to the group including P. acuta. Hannibal (1912, p. 169) subsequently designated P. verrucosa as the type species of Pleurocera based on a rough sketch in Rafinesque's unpublished 'Conchologia Ohioensis' that to him clearly represented Melania nupera Say, 1829, a junior subjective synonym of P. verrucosa. Walker (1917, p. 2) stated that reference to Rafinesque's unpublished 'Conchologia Ohioensis' was 'entirely inadmissible . . . under any construction of the International Code'. He further argued (p. 7) that 'Hannibal's designation of verrucosa as the type of Pleurocera, in 1912, [was] entirely immaterial, as it was either invalid or unnecessary ...' and then (p. 9) formally designated *Pleurocera acuta* 'as the type of the genus Pleurocera Raf.'.

6. The problem concerning the type species of *Pleurocera* was resolved by Opinion 1195 (BZN 38: 259–265) fixing it under the plenary power as *Pleurocerus acutus* Rafinesque in Blainville, 1824. The Commission's ruling on the type species of *Pleurocera* allowed *P. verrucosa* to remain in the genus *Lithasia* as it had been considered a species of either *Lithasia* or *Angitrema* (=*Lithasia*).

#### References

Adams, H. & Adams, A. 1854. The genera of Recent Mollusca, vol. 1. xl, 484 pp. London.

- Agassiz, L. 1846a. Nomina systemica generum molluscorum (recognoverunt J.E. Gray, C. Th. Menke, et H.E. Strickland). Pp. xiv, 98 [separately paginated] in Agassiz, L. [1842–1846]. Nomenclator zoologicus, continens nomina systematica generum Animalium, tam viventium quam fossilium. Jent & Gassmann, Soloduri.
- Agassiz, L. 1846b. Nomeclatoris zoologici; index universalis. Pp. viii. 393 [separately paginated] in: Nomenclator zoologicus, continens nomina systematica generum Animalium, tam viventium quam fossilium. Jent & Gassmann, Soloduri.
- Ahlstedt, S.A. 1980. The molluscan fauna of the Duck River between Normandy and Columbia Dams in central Tennessee. *Bulletin of the American Malacological Union*, **1980**: 60–62.
- Binney, W.G. 1860. Checklist of the shells of North America. Fluviatile Gastropoda. Smithsonian Miscellaneous Collections, 2(6): 7–13.
- Binney, W.G. 1863. Bibliography of North American conchology previous to the year 1860. Part 1. American Authors. vii, 650 pp. Smithsonian Institution, Washington.
- Blainville, H.M.D. de. 1824. Mollusques, Mollusca (Malacoz.). Pp. 1–392 in: Dictionnaire des Sciences Naturelles, vol. 32. 567 pp. Levrault, Paris.
- Bogan, A.E. & Parmalee, P.W. 1983. The Mollusks. *Tennessee's Rare Wildlife*, vol. 2. 123 pp. Tennessee Wildlife Resources Agency, Nashville.
- Bogan, A.E., Pierson, J.M. & Hartfield, P. 1995. Decline in the freshwater gastropod fauna in the Mobile Basin. Pp. 249–252 in LaRoe, E.T., Farris, G.S., Puckett, C.E., Doran, P.D. & Mac, M.J. (Eds.), Our living resources: a report to the Nation on the distribution, abundance, and health of U.S. plants, animals, and ecosystems. U.S. Department of the Interior, National Biological Service, Washington D.C.
- Burch, J.B. 1979. Genera and subgenera of Recent freshwater gastropods of North America (North of Mexico). *Malacological Review*, **12**: 97–100.
- Clarke, A.H. 1983. The distribution and relative abundance of *Lithasia pinguis* (Lea). *Pleurobema plenum* (Lea), *Villosa trabalis* (Conrad), and *Epioblasma sampsoni* (Lea). *American Malacological Bulletin*, 1: 27–30.
- Clench, W.J. 1965. A new species of Lithasia from Mississippi. Nautilus, 79(1): 30-33.
- Fischer, P. 1885. Part 8, pp. 689–784 in Fischer, P., Manuel de conchyliologique et de Paléontologie conchyliologique ou Histoire naturelle des Mollusques vivants et fossiles suivi d'un appendice sur les branchiopodes. 1369 pp. Savy, Paris.
- Goodrich, C. 1921. Something about Angitrema. Nautilus, 35(2): 58-59.
- Goodrich, C. 1929. The pleurocerid fauna of the falls of the Ohio. Nautilus. 43(1): 1-17.
- Goodrich C. 1941. Studies of the gastropod family Pleuroceridae VII. Occasional Papers of the Museum of Zoology, University of Michigan, 447: 1–13.
- Graf, D.L. 2001. The cleansing of the Augean stables, or a lexicon of the nominal species of the Pleuroceridae (Gastropoda: Prosobranchia) of recent North America, north of Mexico. Walkerana, 12: 1–124.
- Haldeman, S.S. 1840. A monograph of the Limniades, or freshwater univalve shells of North America, containing descriptions of apparently new animals in different classes, and the names and characters of the subgenera in Paludina and Anculosa. Supplement to Number One. 3 pp. [Philadelphia].
- Haldeman, S.S. 1841. A monograph of the Limnaides and other freshwater univalve shells of North America. No. 3, [Limnea]. 16 pp. Dobson, Philadelphia.
- Hannibal, H. 1912. A synopsis of the Recent and Tertiary freshwater Mollusca of the California Province, based upon ontogenetic classification. *Proceedings of the Malacological Society of London*, 10: 112–211.
- Herrmannsen, A.N. 1846. Indicis Generum Malacozoorum Primordia, vol. 1. 637 pp. Fischeri, Cassellis.
- Herrmannsen, A.N. 1852. Indicis Generum Malacozoorum. Supplementa et Corrigenda, 140 pp. Fischeri, Cassellis.

- Holznagel, W.E. & Lydeard, C. 2000. A molecular phylogeny of North American Pleuroceridae (Gastropoda: Cerithioidea) based on mitochondrial 16S rDNA sequences. *Journal of Molluscan Studies*, 66: 233–257.
- Millard, V. 1997. Classification of Mollusca. A classification of world wide Mollusca. 544 pp. Victor Millard, South Africa.
- Millard, V. 2001. Classification of Mollusca. A classification of world wide Mollusca, Ed. 2. 1447 pp. Victor Millard, South Africa.
- Minton, R.L. 2002. A cladistic analysis of the genus *Lithasia* (Caenogastropoda: Pleuroceridae) using morphological characters. *Nantilus*, **116**(2): 39–49.
- Morrison, J.P.E. 1940. Haldeman's 1840 supplement. Nautilus, 54(2): 64-66.
- Morrison, J.P.E. 1954. The relationships of Old and New World Melanians. *Proceedings of the United States National Museum*, **103**(3225): 357–394.
- Neave, S.A. 1939. Nomenclator zoologicus. A list of the names of genera and subgenera in zoology from the tenth edition of Linnaeus 1758 to the end of 1935, vol. 2, D-L. 1025 pp. Zoological Society of London, London.
- Pilsbry, H.A. 1917. Rafinesque's genera of fresh-water snails. Nautilus, 30(10): 109-114.
- Pilsbry, H.A. & Rhoads, S.N. 1896. Contributions to the zoology of Tennessee, No. 4. Mollusks. Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences, Philadelphia, 48: 487–506.
- Rafinesque, C.S. 1818a. Discoveries in natural history, made during a journey through the western region of the United States, by Constantine Samuel Rafinesque, Esq. addressed to Samuel L. Mitchell, president and other members of the Lyceum of Natural History, in a letter dated at Louisville, falls of Ohio, 20 July, 1818. *American Monthly Magazine and Critical Review*, **3**: 354–355.
- Rafinesque, C.S. 1818b. Further accounts of discoveries in natural history, in the western States, by Constantine Samuel Rafinesque, Esq., communicated in a letter from that gentleman to the editor. *American Monthly Magazine and Critical Review*, 4: 42.
- Rafinesque, C.S. 1818c. General account of the discoveries made in the zoology of the Western States, by C.F. [sic] Rafinesque, in 1818. American Monthly Magazine and Critical Review, 4: 106–107.
- Rafinesque, C.S. 1819. Prodome de 70 nouveaux genres d'animaux découverts dans l'intérieur des Etats-Unis d'Américque, durant l'année 1818. Journal de Physique, de Chimie, d'Histoire Naturelle, 88: 423–428.
- Rafinesque, C.S. 1820. Annals of nature, or annual synopsis of new genera and species of animals, plants, etc., discovered in North America. First annual number. 16 pp. Lexington.
- Rafinesque, C.S. 1831. Enumeration and account of some remarkable natural objects of the cabinet of Prof. Rafinesque, in Philadelphia: being animals, shells, plants, and fossils, collected by him in North America, between 1816 and 1831. 8 pp. Philadelphia.
- Say, T. 1821. Description of univalve shells of the United States. *Journal of the Academy of Natural Sciences, Philadelphia*, 2: 149–179.
- Say, T. 1829. Descriptions of some new terrestrial and fluviatile shells of North America. *New Harmony Disseminator of useful knowledge*, **2**(17): 259–261.
- Scudder, S.H. 1882. Part 1. Supplemental list. In Scudder, S.H., Nomenclator Zoologicus. An alphabetical list of all generic names that have been employed by naturalists for recent and fossil animals from the earliest times to the close of the year 1879. Bulletin of the United States Museum, 19(1): 1–376.
- Scudder, S.H. 1884. Part II. Universal index to genera in zoology. Complete list of generic names employed in zoology and paleontology to the close of the year 1879, and contained in the nomenclators of Agassiz, Marschall, and Scudder, and in the Zoological Record. In Scudder, S.H., Nomenclator Zoologicus. An alphabetical list of all generic names that have been employed by naturalists for Recent and fossil animals from the earliest times to the close of the year 1879. Bulletin of the United State National Museum, 19(2): 1–340.
- Sherborn, C.D. 1926. Part 9 [Index Dorsalis—Eurystomus] (1801–1850). Pp. 2009–2248 in: Index animalium sive Index nominum quae ab A.D. MDCCLVIII generibus et speciebus animalium imposita sunt. British Museum, London.
- Stansbery, D.H. 1971. Rare and endangered freshwater mollusks in Eastern United States. Pp. 5–18f in Jorgenson, S.E. & Sharp, R.E. (Eds.), *Proceedings of a symposium on rare and*

*endangered mollusks (naiads) of the U.S.* 79 pp. Fish and Wildlife Service, United States Department of the Interior, Washington D.C.

Stein, C.B. 1976. Gastropods. Pp. 21–41 in Boschung, H. (Ed.), Endangered and threatened species of Alabama. Bulletin of the University of Alabama Museum of Natural History. No. 2. Tuscaloosa.

Thiele, J. 1929. Handbuch der systematischen Weichtierkunde, vol. 1. 778 pp. Fischer, Jena.

- Tryon, G.W. 1863, 1864, 1865a. Synonymy of the species of Strepomatidae, a family of fluviatile Mollusca, inhabiting North America. *Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences, Philadelphia*, [1863] 15: 306–321; [1864] 16: 24–48; [1865a] 17: 19–36.
- Tryon, G.W. 1865b. Observations on the family Strepomatidae. American Journal of Conchology, 1(2): 97–135.
- Tryon, G.W. 1865c. Monograph of the family Strepomatidae. *American Journal of Conchology*, 1: 299–321.
- Tryon, G.W. 1873. Land and freshwater shells of North America. Part 4. Strepomatidae. No. 253. [Separately paginated] lv, 435 pp. *in: Smithsonian Miscellaneous Collections*, 16 [1880].
- Vaught, K.C. 1989. A classification of the living Molhusca. 195 pp. American Malacologists, Melbourne, Florida.
- Walker, B. 1917. The type of *Pleurocera* Rafinesque. Occasional Papers of the Museum of Zoology, University of Michigan, 38: 1-10.
- Walker, B. 1918. A synopsis of the classification of the freshwater Mollusca of North America, North of Mexico, and a catalogue of the more recently described species, with notes. *Miscellaneous Publications, Museum of Zoology, University of Michigan*, 6: 1–213.
- Wenz, W. 1938–1944. Gastropoda. Teil I: Allgemeiner Teil; und Prosobranchia. Handbuch der Paläozoologie, vol. 6. 948 pp. Berlin.

Acknowledgement of receipt of this application was published in BZN 59: 161.

Comments on this case are invited for publication (subject to editing) in the *Bulletin*; they should be sent to the Executive Secretary, I.C.Z.N., c/o The Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London SW7 5BD, U.K. (e-mail: iczn@nhm.ac.uk).